



# GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE REFERRAL MECHANISMS

A Focus Group Discussion With Government Service Providers And Community Based / Civil Society Organizations of the Municipality of Maramag, Bukidnon

SANGGUNIANG BAYAN SESSION ROOM MUNICIPAL HALL MARAMAG, BUKIDNON October 3, 2019 (9:00am-5:00 pm)



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

- Page 3 Program
- Page 4 Preliminaries
  - i. Welcome Remarks
  - ii. Objectives
  - iii. Background / Rationale
- Page 7 Focus Group Discussion with Government Service Providers
- Page 13
   Focus Group Discussion with Community and Civil Society Groups
- Page 18Non-Disclosure Notice
- Page 20List of Participants





### FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION

#### **Gender-Based Violence Referral Mechanism**

03 October 2019

Maramag Municipal Hall, Maramag, Bukidnon

### PROGRAM

Morning (8-12nn)

Registration

**Opening Preliminaries** 

Welcome Remarks – Atty. Jeanne Ivy F. Abrina

Objective Setting: Atty. Pilipinas C. Palma

FGD Proper- Government Agencies (Atty. Malucar P. Baliton-Isidra and Kris Ian Lofranco)

**Closing Ceremonies** 

Afternoon (1-5pm)

Registration

**Opening Preliminaries** 

Welcome Remarks – Atty. Jeanne Ivy F. Abrina

Objective Setting: Atty. Pilipinas C. Palma

FGD Proper- Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) (Atty. Kristine T. Gaudiel and Fides Teresa M. Caban)

**Closing Ceremonies** 

#### PRELIMINARIES

Commission on Human Rights – Regional 10 (CHR-X) Regional Director Atty. Jeanne Ivy Abrina thanked the Maramag LGU for hosting the activity and also the participants for being part of the CHR Women's Gender Observatory Project. She explained that the project is a nationwide study with each CHR regional office covering one city and one municipality. CHR-X chose Cagayan de Oro - which they already have conducted the Focus Group Discussion, and Maramag because of the high number of reported cases of gender based violence (GBV). The FGD is being conducted to research on the



prevalence of GBV cases, the willingness of women to report GBV, the ease of access to GBV services and to look at the quality of response of the different government agencies involved.

Atty. Abrina said that the activity also aims to map out the community based and civil society groups involved in responding to GBV cases in Maramag. The information from discussions of the Maramag activity will contribute to the 32 case studies to be presented in the CHR National Report which will be based on the CHR regional reports. CHR-X will submit its report after the regional summit on November 25.

CHR-X Attorney Pilipinas Palma acknowledged the organizations present at the start of the morning session.

- MSWDO
- SSBO
- NDRRMO
- PNP WCPD Office
- Sangguniang Bayan
- Office of the Provincial Prosecutor
- HRMO / GAD Focal Person of Maramag

Atty. Palma provided the background to the activity. That this is part of the Gender Based Violence Observatory Project of CHR that will launch its study on Gender Based Referral Mapping. The GBV Mapping has the following objectives:

- Map GBV Referral mechanisms in two Cities/municipalities in the Regions AOR;
- Look into effectiveness of these mechanisms in terms of availability of facilities, kinds of services, and advocacy and partnership with women's organizations
- Identify challenges and barriers as well as document the good practices in reporting and investigation, prosecution and legal assistance, and providing support services;
- Derive recommendations and proposals to improve the services and facilities offered by mechanisms on the ground; and,
- Focus on the responses to and experiences of the most vulnerable and excluded.

Atty Palma reiterated that CHR-X chose Cagayan de Oro and Maramag because of the high number of reported GBV cases based on information from the PNP Regional Office. At the provincial level Bukidnon is second in reported number of GBV cases after Misamis Oriental and Maramag is second in reported GBV cases in Bukidnon, after Manolo Fortich. Maramag was also chosen because of the presence of indigenous communities in the town. The CHR has already conducted FGD in five pilot areas before the Maramag FGD.

Atty Palma explained that CHR is conducting the FGD as part of its mandate as Gender Ombud based on the Magna Carta for Women which gave CHR the following functions:

- Monitor with the Philippine Commission on Women compliance with RA 9710
- Establish guidelines and mechanisms that will facilitate access of women to legal remedies under RA 9710 and related laws
- Enhance the protection and promotion of the rights of women, especially marginalized women
- Assist in the filing of cases against individuals, agencies, institutions that violate RA 9710 provisions

Atty Palma handed over to the Maramag LGU a hard copy of the CHR "Gender Ombud Guidelines". The publication provides legal bases for government work on gender based violence; guide to work



on Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity and Expression (SOGIE) issues; guide on assisting women victims; guide on investigation and provision of services, aid, education etc. The Maramag study on "Making Data Work for Women" / Gender Based Violence Referral Mechanism – is a component of the Human Rights Observatory program under the Gender Based Violence Observatory Project and information gathered will also be part of the information available on its observatory website.

Atty. Palma presented international and domestic legal bases for the government obligations to work against gender based violence and protect its victims.

Our GBV Legal Frameworks		
CEDAW	• GR 19 VAW (1991) • GR 35 GBV (2017) • KTV (2010); RPB (2014)	
Domestic	<ul> <li>RA 7877 Sexual Harassment Law</li> <li>RA 8353/RA 8505</li> <li>RA 9262 Anti-VAWC Law (15 years!)</li> <li>RA 9710 Magna Carta of Women (10 years!)</li> <li>Garcia vs. Drilon (2013)</li> </ul>	
	CHR: Dignity	

To concretize the protection mechanisms provided by these legal bases for women, Atty Piay cited two cases of Filipinas getting favorable response by the CEDAW Committee on their respective complaints of discrimination against women by the government of the Philippines – these cases further underscored the need for women to access multidisciplinary gender responsive interventions and

services by the Philippine government for gender based violations. Atty. Palma also the existing GBV presented Referral System of the government which provides for a general referral flow form the barangay level up to the national.

To end her discussion on the background of the project Atty. Palma presented some data gathered from the 2017 National

PNP WCPC

11

4 8

95 130 95

Domestic Data: National Demographic Housing Survey		
2013 (among women aged 15-49)	2017	
<ul> <li>1 in 5 women experienced physical violence since age 15</li> <li>6 in 100 women reported having experienced sexual violence</li> <li>4% of women experienced physical violence during pregnancy</li> <li>Only 3 of 10 women sought help to stop the violence</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>1 in 4 -married women experienced spousal violence (physical, sexual, or emotional) by a current or most recent husband/partner; (15% in the last year)</li> <li>17% have ever experienced physical violence since age 15; (5% in the last year)</li> <li>5% of women have ever experienced sexual violence; (2% in the last year)</li> <li>*Most prevalent spousal abuse: emotional at 20%</li> <li>*decreases with wealth 29 (poorest)</li> </ul>	
	17 (wealthiest)	
ATA: Nov. 2018	CHR: Dignity of a	
Processors Sametal and Thomas, Poulogi The Technol Center and Concerner Sametal Conce	Demographic Housing Survey - which	
HBER 6, 2015 1980 7 1980 8 1980 9 1980 10 1980 11 1980 12 1980 13 80 ABMPRO COE WCPC Grant Tebri 199 60 33 50 40 60 44 5 51 100 199 60 33 50 40 60 44 5 51 100 190 60 33 50 40 60 44 5 51 100 190 60 30 50 40 60 44 5 51 100 190 60 30 50 40 60 44 5 51 100 190 60 30 50 40 60 44 5 51 100 190 60 30 50 40 60 44 5 51 100 190 60 30 50 40 60 44 5 51 100 190 60 30 50 40 60 44 5 51 100 190 60 30 50 40 60 44 5 51 100 190 60 30 50 40 60 44 5 51 100 190 60 30 50 40 60 44 5 51 100 190 60 30 50 40 60 40 5 51 100 190 60 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50 50	showed among others	

showed among others reasons for domestic spousal abuse as well as attitudes to gender based violence – and the 2018 PNP data on gender / sexual related crimes.



# MORNING FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION



CHR-X Attorney Macular Baliton-Isidra and CHR-X Special Investigator Kris Ian Lofranco facilitated the Focus Group Discussion with Government Service Providers in the Morning Session. The discussion will focus on five topics:

- 1. Gender equality situationer in Maramag
- 2. Gender-based violence in Maramag
- 3. Case management for GBV (specific to the service provider)
- 4. Documentation
- 5. Recommendations

#### **GENDER EQUALITY SITUATIONER**

The group was asked if their agencies kept basic demographic information on GBV cases:

The PNP WCPD Office said that it is their standard operating procedure to gather basic data of victims and the case. GBV case data and information is segregated from other cases and are kept confidential. The MSWDO also said that they also keep demographic data on GBV cases.

The group was then asked whether they have an internal gender related policy or if they know of any policies by the local government:

The HRMO said that they have a policy on sexual related cases on the workplace and have already set up a committee on it, which has not received any complaint until the present. This policy has been disseminated to their employees.

The group was asked if they have any experience in Gender and Development Budget and Mainstreaming and whether they have used this for servicing GBV cases:

The MSWDO answered that they do utilize the GAD Budget for information dissemination and skills training for women.

#### **GENDER BASED VIOLENCE CASES**

The group was asked what were the common forms of GBV cases they received and assisted:



The MSWDO answered Abuse (physical, sexual, economic, psychological), Acts of Lasciviousness and Rape. They clarified that most of the economic abuse cases were about deprivation of child Support.

The PNP WCPD Office narrated that cases they dealt with were Violations of the laws on Anti-VAWC and Anti-Voyeurism (peeping and video recording), Act of Lasciviousness and Concubinage. They remarked about the increased use of digital technology against women.

The Provincial Prosecutor shared that the fiscals would receive complaints for Violation of the Anti-VAWC Law and Anti-Rape Law. Anti VAWC cases ranged from physical violence against women, deprivation of child support, husbands with mistresses / concubines. Rape cases included cases against minors, incest victims and people with disabilities. Because victims included minors, there were also Violations of Child Protection Laws.

The Provincial Prosecutor also remarked about a rising trend in charges of Adultery being filed against women by their husbands.

At this point the SB Member posed a question to the CHR about any intervention from CHR on instances of desistance on the part of the wife-complainants which happens in many cases in Maramag. Atty. Palma said that even with desistance on complaints/cases, other interventions should still be extended to the wife such as economic support. She underscored the need for empowerment of women so that they continue with their complaints. CHR Special Investigator Cabana asked whether women can seek economic support and empowerment from the MSWDO which answered that they have trainings for women empowerment.

# The group was then asked by the facilitators what interventions and support they were able to provide:

The MSWDO said that the first thing they do is to bring the victim to the PNP to ensure proper documentation. The MSWDO will then provide the victim with referrals for psychosocial and legal support. They said that they can provide counseling but they don't have a licensed psychologist at the moment.

Regarding implementation of the 10:00PM Curfew for minors, the PNP said they start roving even before 10:00pm so that minors will be "reminded" to go home. If there are arrests, they bring those arrested to the police station for their safety and then turned over to the MSWDO. The MSWDO said that upon receiving arrested minors they conduct pre-assessment, contact their family, then release them to their families after some counseling. If the minors are not from Maramag then they will turn them over to the respective MSWDO of their hometowns.

The Private Prosecutor shared of the challenge they face when LGU officials intervene in GBV cases and cited an instance where the barangay official brought AAA to the mayor's office who then arranged a phone interview for AAA by the local press in Cagayan de Oro. It was only after the call that AAA was sent to the PNP. The Provincial Prosecutor recommended that local government officials be reminded not to intervene in the investigation of GBV cases.

The MSWDO also share that they know of GBV cases being "resolved for amicable settlement" by officials at the Barangay level.

# The group was asked which particular group of women are affected the most by gender based violence:

The PNP WCPD Office said that sometimes that information is left blank in the intake form because the victim does not know what group or sector she belongs to.

#### The group was asked about any trends in GBV cases that they noticed:

The Provincial Prosecutor said that victims of VAWC cases were mostly from the "C and D" economic groups. Some are uneducated and there was a case involving a person with disability. He also



mentioned that there were several cases where the complainants did not appear in court. He said that in rape cases, victims would accept thirty to fifty thousand pesos and not appear in court anymore. Aside from interventions for empowerment and independence of women, he said it is important to have a mechanism to detect whether the victim or complainant has "battered wife syndrome".

The PNP WCPD Office added that they also know of such cases where the complainant will not continue with the case filed in court either because they accepted money as settlement of the case or wives would "pity and forgive" their perpetrator-husbands. In cases where the wife has been abused and filed complaints several times already only to desist from the court case each time, the MSWDO said they just advise the couple to separate.

The Provincial Prosecutor also shared of the difficulties in language and translation in some cases involving indigenous women. He then reiterated that GBV cases should not be 'resolved' by barangay officials as this is against the law.

CHR Atty. Baliton-Isidra said maybe barangay officials are not familiar with the Anti-VAWC law and they do not know that they cannot resolve GBV cases, she asked the group whether the town officials have intervened regarding this situation to orient the barangay officials regarding this matter.

No one answered this question.

The MSWDO then shared that they noticed that the number of GBV cases that they receive in their office is declining, although this may be because of the fact that there are GBV cases being resolved and settled in the barangay.

# The group was asked what other difficulties they face in handling GBV cases:

The PNP WCPD Office shared of their difficulty in getting information from children five years old and below, especially when the child victims-survivor have not gone through the MSWDO before their interview with the PNP.

The MSWDO also shared their difficulty in what approach to use with children who are rape victims, given the situation that they do not have a licensed psychologist. They usually cannot get all the information in one day.

The Provincial Prosecutor on his part also shared that in cases for Preliminary Investigation it was alright for child victims-survivors to continue with their interview at another time, but the situation is more difficult in Inquest Cases where they have to urgently need to get the information from the child victim who will not 'immediately' tell their story to the fiscals, specially male fiscals, and also without any social worker present.

In relation to this difficulty in dealing with child victims, CHR-X Special Investigator Raymundo Cajes asked the group whether they get trainings related to handing child victims and whether they consider psychological elements in intervening in GBV cases.

The Provincial Prosecutor answered that there are trainings in handling child victims-survivor. Still he said that he hopes the MSWDO can intervene in such cases because children are more relaxed with social workers and relatives. He shared that it is easier interviewing children aged 12 and higher. But he clarified that the level of information that they need is only to attain requirements of 'probable cause' and not 'proof beyond reasonable doubt'. If it is a rape case, they also have to see whether the case falls under RA 7610 or Rape under the Revised Penal Code.

#### The group was asked of their successes in intervening in GBV cases:

The PNP WCPD Office shared that they consider successes those 'cases that go directly for inquest', while the Provincial Prosecutor said 'wives that do not desist'. The fiscal also shared that he is happy he has not lost any rape case that he handled. The MSWDO shared about a case where they continued their support to the victim-survivor even in the face of receiving "threats" – this case was won in court.



The Municipal Health Officer shared that she is proud of one case where she did not fold in to pressure from the military to change the findings of the physical examination of rape victim-survivor.

### CASE MANAGEMENT

#### The facilitators asked about the entry point of a GBV case:

#### The MSWDO said that they follow national case flow protocols depending on the case.

The Provincial Prosecutor answered that for their office, GBV complaints are either filed by the victims or the police. One challenge faced by fiscals is the delay in the release of necessary documentary evidence from government offices such as medical certificates.

The Municipal Health Officer on her part said that in their office, the case is made known to them either by relatives of victims or by barangay officials. The MHO will advise them to get a medical exam or medico legal request from the police. The Maramag MHO follows the "service delivery network protocol" of government health offices.

At this point CHR-X Investigator Cajes asked about the importance of the use of medical examination in a court case; the difference in medical examination conducted by private clinics as against government health offices; and whether stating the healing period is important in court. CHR-X Attorney Gaudiel also asked whether it is true what they heard that a rape case will be dismissed if there is no psychological evaluation report on the rape victim.

The MHO answered that private physicians will mostly decline if the request is for a medico legal exam because of the hassle of the necessity of appearing in court. The "healing period" is necessary to be included in the report or certification.

The Provincial Prosecutor replied that the healing period matters as to what case will be filed in court. He said the medical certificate is very important but he will use it depending whether it is favorable to his case or not. As to the psychological evaluation, the fiscal reiterated that it is the testimony of the victim that the judgment of the rape case should hinge on.

# Moving on, the group was then asked who in their office determines the appropriate remedies needed in a GBV case:

The PNP WCPD Office said that after their documentation, they refer the case to either the MSWDO, the MHO or the Provincial Prosecutor for case prosecution. The MSWDO answered that whatever case they receive, it is their SOP to provide psychosocial service, then they will evaluate further remedies needed. Most cases require counseling and financial assistance for transportation and meals in attending case trials specially those in Malaybalay City.

#### DOCUMENTATION

#### The facilitators asked the group when does the documentation of a GBV case start:

The PNP said depending on the gravity of the case they usually make a blotter, an incident report or straight to inquest. GBV case information is also stored in electronic form which they can only access, it is kept confidential and not published. The WCPD keeps the document as a permanent record. GBV statistics will be forwarded to the province but not the case folder.

The MSWDO said that they use an intake form. They store GBV case documents separated in individual case folders that is kept in a steel cabinet that only their staff has access to. GBV case stats will be forwarded to the province and region, but individual case folders need to be requested for information to be forwarded. They are still in the process of digitizing their records so that they can



store the information electronically. The VAWC folder is kept as a permanent record. In cases of children in conflict with the law (CICL), they will request the court to burn the records after the trial.

The MHO answered that in their office GBV case documents are kept in a separate cabinet for five years, they will not share the information or the case records except with the court. Aside from documentation protocol, the MHO said that in cases of rape they will automatically check for STIs and then also require an HIV examination in three months.

CHR-X Investigator Cajes asked about rape complaints being documented as 'love triangle' in the incident report which will then be dismissed by the fiscal. The Provincial Prosecutor replied that the fiscal will have the final say regarding the analysis of the complaint of the victim and as to what case may be filed in court.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

# The facilitators asked the group if they have recommendations to improve interventions and services for victims of gender-based violence.

The PNP WCPD Office replied that they need additional personnel because sometimes they have a long line of complainants waiting for their turn to be interviewed. The MHO also hoped for additional doctor for medico-legal needs, she said they cannot shortcut the procedure for signing medical certificates – such as for medical certificates when the MHO has not even seen the cadaver – because this will heavily impact the court case. The HRO said that it would be good if the DSWD Program on Gender Based Violence be implemented in Maramag.

At this point the other participants one by one extended their gratitude to the CHR for inviting them to the discussion. The PNP was thankful for the presence of the MSWDO, the MHO and the Provincial Prosecutor because they work with each other in servicing GBV case victims-survivors.

The FGD participants from the representatives of the local government unit of the Municipality of Maramag, Maramag, Bukidnon





### AFTERNOON FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION

The same with the morning session, Atty Palma provided the background of the activity after acknowledging the organizations present at the start of the session for the afternoon Focus Group Discussion:

San Andres Parish Women's Advocate Maramag Teen Center / Tambayan ng Kabataan South Poblacion Barangay VAWC Desk North Poblacion Barangay Women's Group Maramag Municipal Council

Atty Kristine T. Gaudiel and CHR-X Special Investigator Fides Teresa Cabana facilitated the Focus Group Discussion with Civil Society Organizations in the Afternoon Session. As in the morning session, the discussion will focus on five topics:

- 1. Gender equality situationer in Maramag
- 2. Gender-based violence in Maramag
- 3. Case management for GBV (specific to the service provider)
- 4. Documentation
- 5. Recommendations

#### **GENDER EQUALITY SITUATIONER**

#### The facilitators asked the group whether they know of any gender related policy in Maramag:

The Municipal Counselor said that there are livelihood projects supported by the municipal Gender and Development (GAD) Budget being extended to women's groups in barangays. There are also other trainings for women aside from livelihood. Aside from that, there are also women's assemblies during International Women's Month. All these passed through the approval of the municipal council.

The South Poblacion Barangay VAWC Desk replied that they have trainings for VAWC Desk Officers and they also provide counseling for women.

The BNSHI Teen Center shared their services: they have peer counselors that facilitate focus group discussions on teen issues such as pregnancy, SOGIE, depression, etc; their strategy is to focus on "prevention", if they cannot handle a case they refer this to the Maramag Teen Center from which they get support including funding. Any information shared with the center is kept confidential.

The San Andres Parish women's advocate shared that they also facilitate trainings for women, but they have not yet tapped the GAD budget of Maramag.

The North Poblacion Barangay Women's Group said they refer VAWC cases to the PNP or the MSWDO.

#### **GENDER BASED VIOLENCE IN MARAMAG**



The group was asked what is the common form of gender-based violence case based on their experience:

The North Poblacion Barangay Women's Group said VAWC by physical abuse through beatings by their husbands. They usually offer counselling or referral to the MSWDO.

The San Andres Parish Women's Advocates answered rape cases. They find it difficult right now to provide financial or livelihood assistance.

The municipal councilor on her part said that the number of VAWC cases is not increasing because the women are already empowered. She added that there are NC2 certification level trainings for PWDs and they were provided with a 'center' where they can offer massage service.

The BNSHI Teen Center narrated: economic and physical abuse of teens by their guardians; peer pressure by other teens; teen pregnancy (specially related to alcohol drinking).

The Maramag IPMR said that in indigenous areas, the problem is indigenous students skipping school.

The Maramag Teen Center shared about the case of abuse by the BBB's stepfather. She also shared that she knows of cases of wives who wanted to access family planning services but were not 'permitted' by their husbands.

The group was then asked where do GBV victims go to complain or seek help:

The North Poblacion Barangay Women's Group said victims usually go the barangay officials. The South Poblacion Barangay VAWC Desk on their part said that if they receive a complaint they refer this to the MSWDO, especially if a case will be filed in court.

The Municipal Counselor shared that for cases of CICL or VAWC, they refer these cases to the Bahay Pag-Asa Center of the MSWDO for shelter. If the town cannot provide necessary counseling services then the case will be referred to the province.

The Maramag Teen Center said they follow the referral system protocol of the Information Service Delivery Network (ISDN). The group also provides counseling and medical services for teens (aged 19 and below).

The IPMR shared that in their area there is access to ambulance and even legal services. But the problem is when the parents of rape victims-survivors themselves are against the filing of cases in court against the perpetrator/s.

Here, CHR-X Investigator Cajes asked whether indigenous culture violates women's rights and gave 'duway' (polygamy) as a specific example. To which the IPMR replied that 'duway' is meant to answer the need to establish a family (which he said is the main reason for indigenous marriages) in cases where the first wife cannot beget a child. The first wife is not violated because she understands this need to establish a family and it is her who chooses who becomes the second wife or if needed, the succeeding wives. Moreover, indigenous culture respects and protects rights of victimized women, he said that in the past - perpetrators of rape were even penalized with death.

# DOCUMENTATION

The group was asked how they manage documentation and information in GBV cases as well as best practices:

The South Poblacion VAWC Desk replied that they treat GBV case information confidential, case folders are locked in a separate cabinet and only the victim can request for access to the record.



The BNSHI Teen Center said they have not had a grave case yet that warrants case documentation but they do keep a logbook of each activity that includes a narrative report. Because teens are encouraged to open up during counseling and team immersion, anything that has been shared verbally to peer counselors and mentors are kept confidential.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS**

The group was then asked for recommendations in improving services and intervention for victims of gender-based violence:

The San Andres Parish Women's Advocates said it would be good to look at sexual exploitation of women in bars, even those in other places such as in Cagayan de Oro because they may have women from Maramag. Another thing to look into is the practice of 'Akyat Truck' where women have sex with truck drivers – even tricycle drivers – in exchange for money. She said she heard of cases involving BNSHI students.

The BNSHI Teen Center recommended enhancing livelihood program for women and assistance in setting up digital / social media-based counselling. He also recommended to the CHR to set up a satellite office for Bukidnon as the office in Cagayan de Oro is too far away. Attorney Gaudiel replied that this is a good idea, but in the meantime, they can maximize accessing the CHR Region 10 Facebook Page and the Legal Clinic that will be conducted by CHR the day after the focus group discussion on GBV.

The Sangguniang Kabataan Chairperson for Barangay Togolon recommended human rights seminars for youth, specially connected to teen issues such as teen pregnancy and drug addiction. Attorney Gaudiel said that they can request the CHR for resource persons – to which the Maramag Teen Center replied that the CHR will be invited to speak during the Linggo ng Kabataan in Maramag. She further said that they are looking forward to the invitation and it will under the CHR's Kabataan – Karapatan Caravan (KKC).

At this point each of the participants thanked the CHR for being invited and for the fruitful discussion that afternoon.